

COUNCIL ASSESSMENT REPORT

Panel Reference	
DA Number	DA/437/2021
LGA	Randwick City Council
Proposed Development	Integrated development for demolition of buildings, works to the Coogee Bay Hotel, construction of a 6 storey shop-top housing development comprising business premises with supermarket, public laneway, basement parking, 60 residential units, subdivision, landscaping and associated works (Local Heritage Item, variations to FSR and height of buildings of the RLEP 2012).
Street Address	212 Arden Street COOGEE NSW 2034; 227-233 Coogee Bay Road COOGEE NSW 2034; 5-7 Vicar Street COOGEE NSW 2034 and; 15A Vicar Street COOGEE NSW 2034.
Applicant/Owner	Cotton Development Management Pty Ltd c/- Urbis
Date of DA lodgement	22 July 2021
Total number of Submissions Number of Unique Objections	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 354, plus 2 petitions exceeding a total of 5,028 signers. • 273
Recommendation	Refusal
Regional Development Criteria (Schedule 7 of the SEPP (State and Regional Development) 2011	Clause 2, Schedule 7 of SEPP (State and Regional Development) 2011.
List of all relevant s4.15(1)(a) matters	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • State Environmental Planning Policy No. 55 – Remediation of Land; • State Environmental Planning Policy (Infrastructure) 2007; • State Environmental Planning Policy (SEPP) No. 65 – Design Quality of Residential Apartment Building; • State Environmental Planning Policy (Affordable Rental Housing) 2009; • State Environmental Planning Policy (Building Sustainability Index: BASIX) 2004; • State Environmental Planning Policy (Vegetation in Non-Rural Areas) 2017; • Randwick Local Environmental Plan 2012
List all documents submitted with this report for the Panel's consideration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Development Application Assessment Report with attachments A & B • All documents are per Portal lodgement (listed below): • Sheet 3 of 3 - 3D Model - 212 Arden Street Coogee • Sheet 1 of 3 - 3D Model - 212 Arden Street Coogee • DA702 - Adaptable Apartments Pre and Post Adaptation - 212 Arden Street Coogee • DA701 - Adaptable Apartments Pre and Post Adaptation - 212 Arden Street Coogee • DA700 - Adaptable Apartments Pre and Post Adaptation - 212 Arden Street Coogee • DA421 - 3D Massing - Existing Building Overlay - 212 Arden Street Coogee • DA420 - 3D Massing - 12M Height Plan Overlay Proposed - 212 Arden Street Coogee • DA419 - 3D Massing - 12M Height Plan Overlay Existing - 212 Arden Street Coogee • DA418 - 3D Massing - 12M Height Plan Overlay Proposed - 212 Arden Street Coogee • DA417 - 3D Massing - 12M Height Plan Overlay Existing - 212 Arden Street Coogee • DA416 - 3D Massing - Proposed - 212 Arden Street Coogee • DA415 - 3D Massing - Proposed - 212 Arden Street Coogee • DA414 - 3D Massing - Max Envelope - 212 Arden Street Coogee • DA411 - SEPP 65 Compliance - Cross Ventilation - 212 Arden Street Coogee • DA410 - SEPP 65 Compliance - Solar Access - 212 Arden Street Coogee • DA409 - SEPP 65 Compliance - Storage - 212 Arden Street Coogee • CV-C1020 - Stormwater Plan - 212 Arden Street Coogee • CV-C1007 - Erosion and Sediment Control Detail - 212 Arden Street Coogee • CV-C1005 - Erosion and Sediment Control - 212 Arden Street Coogee • CV-C1000 - Cover and Notes Sheet - 212 Arden Street Coogee • CV-C0042 - Detail Sheet 2 - 212 Arden Street Coogee • CV-C0041 - Detail Sheet 1 - 212 Arden Street Coogee • CV-C0040 - Pavement Plan - 212 Arden Street Coogee • CV-C0000 - Cover and Notes Sheet - 212 Arden Street Coogee • DA426 - Shadow Diagram - Impact on Vicar Street Proposed - 212 Arden Street Coogee • DA425 - Shadow Diagram - Impact on Vicar Street Existing - 212 Arden Street Coogee • DA407 - Shadow Diagram - Impact on 230 Arden Street - 212 Arden Street Coogee • DA406 - Sun View Diagrams - Sheet 3 - 212 Arden Street Coogee • DA405 - Sun View Diagrams - Sheet 2 - 212 Arden Street Coogee

- DA404 - Sun View Diagrams - Sheet 1 - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA403 - Shadow Diagram 22 March - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA402 - Shadow Diagram 22 September - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA401 - Shadow Diagram 21 June - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA400 - Shadow Diagrams Existing - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA304 - Perspective View 5 - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA303 - Perspective View 4 - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA302 - Perspective View 3 - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA301 - Perspective View 2 - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA300 - Perspective View 1 - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA253 - Section DD - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA252 - Section CC - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA251 - Section BB - Arden Street - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA250 - Section AA - Vicar Street - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA208 - Elevation - North Internal - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA207 - Elevation - South Internal - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA206 - Elevation - East Residence - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA205 - Elevation - West Eat Street - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA204 - Elevation - East Eat Street - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA203 - Elevation - West - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA202 - Elevation - East - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA201 - Elevation - South - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA200 - Elevation - North - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- Sheet 4 of 4 - Plan Showing Elevations of Heritage Buildings at 212 Arden Street Coogee - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- Sheet 3 of 4 - Plan Showing Elevations Surrounding 212 Arden Street Coogee - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- Sheet 2 of 4 - Plan Showing Selected Detail & Levels Over 212 Arden Street Coogee - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- Sheet 1 of 4 - Plan Showing Selected Detail & Levels Over 212 Arden Street Coogee - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA106 - Level 06 Roof Plan - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA105 - Level 05 Floor Plan - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA104 - Level 04 Floor Plan - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA103 - Level 03 Floor Plan - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA102 - Level 02 Floor Plan - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA101 - Level 01 Floor Plan - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA100 - Ground Floor Plan - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA099 - Basement Level 01 - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA098 - Basement Level 02 - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA097 - Basement Level 03 - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA010 - Demolition Plan - Level 2 - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA009 - Demolition Plan - Level 1 - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA008 - Demolition Plan - Ground Floor - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA007 - Existing Plan - Roof - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA006 - Existing Plan - Level 2 - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA005 - Existing Plan - Level 1 - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA004 - Existing Plan - Ground Level - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA003 - Site Plan Demolition - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA002 - Site Plan Existing - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA001 - Locality Plan - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- DA000 - Cover Sheet - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- Development Application - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- SEE - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- Notification Plan - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- Notification Plan - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- Appendix W - Randwick DCP 2013 Compliance Summary Table - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- Clause 4.6 Variation Request - Floor Space Ratio - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- Clause 4.6 Variation Request - Height of Buildings - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- Plan of Management - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- CPTED Assessment - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- Social Impact Assessment - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- Operational Waste Management Plan - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- Traffic Impact Statement - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- Acoustic Assessment - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- Access Capability Statement - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- BCA Assessment Report - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- Civil Engineering Report - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- Preliminary Site Investigation - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- Preliminary Geotechnical Report - 212 Arden Street Coogee
- Heritage Impact Statement - 212 Arden Street Coogee

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>View Sharing Report- 212 Arden Street Coogee</i> • <i>NatHERS Certificates - 212 Arden Street Coogee</i> • <i>BASIX Certificate - 212 Arden Street Coogee</i> • <i>Landscape Design Report - 212 Arden Street Coogee</i> • <i>Design Report - 212 Arden Street Coogee</i> • <i>DA209 - Material Palette - 212 Arden Street Coogee</i> • <i>DA012 - Development Summary Sheet - 212 Arden Street Coogee</i> • <i>Notification Plan - 212 Arden Street Coogee</i> • <i>DA011 - Site Plan Proposed - 212 Arden Street Coogee</i> • <i>Appendix D13 - DA413 - Landscaped Area Diagrams - 212 Arden Street Coogee</i> • <i>Appendix D12 - DA412 - GFA Diagrams - 212 Arden Street Coogee</i> • <i>Appendix C - Deposited Plan Administration Sheet - 212 Arden Street Coogee</i> • <i>Cost Report Form - 212 Arden Street Coogee</i> • <i>Additional Lodgement Checklist for SEPP 65 - 212 Arden Street Coogee</i> • <i>Airspace Protection Form - 212 Arden Street Coogee</i>
Clause 4.6 requests	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Randwick Local Environmental Plan 2012 • Clause 4.6 to vary Clause 4.3 Height of Buildings • Clause 4.6 to vary Clause 4.4 Floor Space Ratio • Zone B2 Local Centre
Summary of key submissions	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Significant non-compliance with Council's controls, particularly relating to height and FSR. The potential to set a precedent for developments that do not comply with Council's controls and turn Coogee into another Bondi, Gold Coast or Surfer's Paradise with high-rise buildings. • The bulk, scale and density proposed is not in keeping with the village character of Coogee. • View loss of the beach/water and significant land forms from individual properties including Wedding Cake Island, and the impact of the development on views and outlook from the foreshore and broader Coogee area. • Solar access impacts and overshadowing to adjacent properties and the foreshore. • Significant impact on the local road network including increase in traffic generation, greater demands on street parking, conflict with existing businesses and their deliveries (in particular the Post Office on Vicar St), and impact on pedestrian safety. • Concerns that the scale of development results in overpopulation and overcrowding, especially during peak summer periods. • Concern with the past and current anti-social behaviour related to the Coogee Bay Hotel, and how this will continue with the proposed development. Also concern that the development will create additional safety and security risks for the local area. • The economic impact of an additional supermarket and commercial uses on the existing commercial premises within Coogee. No economic study has been submitted to address the demand for a large scale supermarket. Coogee does not need another supermarket or more residential units. • The impact of the development on the heritage significance of the Coogee Bay Hotel and other heritage properties within the vicinity of the site. • The development does not result in any public benefit. • Noise (from construction and operation) and odour issues. • Conflict of the pub use with new and expensive residential units immediately adjoining on the site. • Loss of the iconic Selina's live venue, and consequent loss of arts and culture for the area. • The loss of lower rental income properties. The development does not include any affordable housing and will displace existing residents who cannot afford to buy into the new development. • Lack of community input during the pre-lodgement stage and timing of lodgement during Covid restrictions, making it hard for people to view documents. Also the acoustic and traffic reports were done during quieter times, in winter and/or during Covid restrictions. • Reference to the 2009 scheme which was not supported. • Loss of trees from the site along Arden St. • Extent of excavation, impact on drainage, and disruption to area during construction, particularly in Vicar St and along Coogee Bay Rd. • Devalue existing property prices, particular those with view loss.
Report prepared by	GAT & Associates
Report date	25 November 2021

Summary of s4.15 matters

Have all recommendations in relation to relevant s4.15 matters been summarised in the Executive Summary of the assessment report?

Yes

Legislative clauses requiring consent authority satisfaction

Have relevant clauses in all applicable environmental planning instruments where the consent authority must be satisfied about a particular matter been listed, and relevant recommendations summarized, in the Executive Summary of the assessment report?

Yes

e.g. Clause 7 of SEPP 55 - Remediation of Land, Clause 4.6(4) of the relevant LEP

Clause 4.6 Exceptions to development standards

If a written request for a contravention to a development standard (clause 4.6 of the LEP) has been received, has it been attached to the assessment report?

Yes**Special Infrastructure Contributions**

Does the DA require Special Infrastructure Contributions conditions (S7.24)?

Note: Certain DAs in the Western Sydney Growth Areas Special Contributions Area may require specific Special Infrastructure Contributions (SIC) conditions

Not applicable**Conditions**

Have draft conditions been provided to the applicant for comment?

Note: in order to reduce delays in determinations, the Panel prefer that draft conditions, notwithstanding Council's recommendation, be provided to the applicant to enable any comments to be considered as part of the assessment report

No