



Statement of Heritage Impact for:
Uniting War Memorial Hospital Planning Proposal

This statement forms part of the assessment documents lodged for:
A Planning Proposal to amend the Waverley Local Environmental Plan 2012 (LEP) in respect of the
Uniting War Memorial Hospital, Waverley

Date: Version V1.1 of 11 February 2021

Reference to current listings:

In Schedule 5 of the Waverley Local Environmental Plan 2012, are listed the following items which are
subject of this statement:

War Memorial Hospital, Late Victorian buildings and former stables (item no. 1449)

Queens Park Urban Conservation Area (C14)

Botany Street Conservation Area (C3)

Address and property description:

125 Birrell Street, Waverley	Lot 1 DP 948186
124-160 Bronte Road, Waverley	Lot 4 DP 593710
162 Bronte Road, Waverley	Lot 1 DP 166786
164 Bronte Road, Waverley	Lot 1 DP 1115706
2 Church Street, Waverley	Lot 1 DP 630460
4 Church Street, Waverley	Lot 2 DP 630460
6 Church Street, Waverley	Lot 1 DP 167332
8 Church Street, Waverley	Lot 1 DP 1098550
99 - 121 Birrell Street, Waverley	Lot 1 DP 312247, Lots 1 & 2 DP515904, Lots A & B DP 437866, Lot 1 DP 961790, Lot 11 DP 667554, Lot 3 DP520982, Lots 1 & 2 DP 212655, Lot A DP 317831.

Prepared by:
Hector Abrahams and Tristan Ryan
Hector Abrahams Architects Pty Ltd

For:
Uniting (NSW)

Acknowledgement of Country

We acknowledge the Gadigal and Bidjigal people of the Eora nation, the original inhabitants of the land on which we live and work and the subject site, who have been custodians of Country for thousands of generations, and all First Peoples who have and continue to occupy this continent.

Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples have a connection to place, land, water and community that has been unbroken for 120,000 years. We recognise the cultural significance inherent in these connections, that sovereignty over this land was never ceded and that it continues to be sacred to its rightful owners.

We pay respect to Elders past and present, and stand with all First Peoples in their quest for self-determination, justice, truth telling and reconciliation.

Summary of Assessment

The following aspects of the proposal respect or enhance the heritage significance of the item or conservation area for the following reasons:

- *Provision for new landscaping and path system in the western part of the site.*
This proposal will interpret the landscaping of the original estate, with a path that follows a similar line to the original carriageway, and a sequence of spaces reminiscent of a Victorian garden.
- *Change in controls to allow buildings of up to 7 storeys around the perimeter of the western portion of the site, in the centre of the site, and to the south of Ellerslie.*
The proposal will allow the rationalisation of the western portion of the site, which at present is confused and the historic relationship between the Birrell Street and Bronte Road entrance and Edina. The proposed RAC building in the centre of the site is to have an axial relationship with Edina and there will be an entrance from the gate that finishes on this axis, restoring this relationship. 4 to 7 storeys – specified for each envelope location - is an appropriate height for the buildings to ensure they do not overwhelm or diminish the heritage buildings, which are largely concentrated at the eastern portion of the site. The construction of new buildings for residential aged care, assisted and independent living for the elderly, and hospital use is appropriate to the current and historical use of the site.
- *Avoiding redundancy of original estate gates*
The proposal will avoid the original gates to the estate becoming redundant by restoring their use as private gates. The demolished gatehouse will also be interpreted by the design of the building adjacent to the gates.

The following aspects of the proposal could detrimentally impact on heritage significance:

- *Loss of trees, including significant trees.*
The proposal requires the removal of several trees, including some which are significant, and may put other trees at risk. This impact is ameliorated by the proposed replacement of two of the largest trees with trees of a similar mature transplantable size and in particular by the proposed landscaping of the place as a unified estate, conserving the upper garden and recreating a lower garden. As a whole, the proposal represents a vast improvement in heritage terms for the landscaping of the site.

The following sympathetic solutions have been considered and discounted for the following reasons:

- At this master planning stage, a range of options for siting of buildings have been considered. This option has the benefit of unifying the state around a central garden space, which was not achievable without some loss of trees.

Introduction

This report examines the heritage implications of the planning proposal relating to the Uniting War Memorial Hospital, Waverley. The proposal is outlined in the master plan prepared by Architectus with the input of others, including the authors of this report.

This report is authored by Hector Abrahams, who has advised Uniting over the last five years about heritage on its hospital site, prepared a conservation management plan for it, and is familiar with the subject site, and Tristan Ryan, who has been involved in the master planning process with Architectus and has visited the site on a number of occasions. The report has been prepared in the form prescribed by the NSW Heritage Office publication *Statements of Heritage Impact (2002)*.

Description and Historical Context

The site is a large hospital and health facility that has been purposefully developed out of the nineteenth century residential estate of Ebenezer Vickery (1827-1906). A detailed description and photographs of the site are found in section 4 of the CMP, and the history of the site in section 3. The names of site features in this report are those indicated in Figure 1. Site Location Plan, in the CMP.

The area of the planning proposal is larger than that covered in the CMP. The additional area comprises some houses on Birrell Street, which are not of heritage significance, and two cottages on Church Street which, although not historically part of the hospital, are items of environmental heritage in the LEP. The entire site covered by the planning proposal was originally part of the Vickery Estate and the proposal seeks, in part, to restore the estate to its original boundaries.

Urban context

Birrell Street is a major straight road that climbs from its low western end at Centennial Park to the summit at its junction with Carrington Road. The subject site is in its uppermost block which is built-up with a substantial collection of cottages and houses from the late Victorian and Edwardian period (on Birrell and Church Streets), a collection of mid-20th century and more recent buildings associated with its hospital and aged care functions (mostly along Bronte Rd) and the original Vickery Estate buildings and earlier hospital buildings (in the eastern part of the site). The site slopes up from west to east, and at its highest point is Edina, the original house of the Vickery Estate

Historical context

All the houses on the south side of Birrell Street between Carrington and Bronte roads are related to the old Vickery estate in one of two ways, some directly related and some associated. At the top are two mid/late Victorian houses, called Ellerslie and Banksia, presenting side elevations in such a way as to form the entry to the private family street of the Vickery family estate.

At the low Western end of the estate are the substantial remains of the formal entrance to the estate. These include a grand palisade fence on a stone base and a grand set of gates. On open ground immediately inside is the site of a former Gatehouse to the estate which is known from photographs to have been a decorative Victorian Gothic work.

The ten cottages between the private houses straight down to the Vickery estate formal entry are modest Edwardian detached and semidetached cottages. These were not part of the Vickery estate but were developed by members of the Vickery family on land given to them at the time the estate was partially broken up c. 1906.

The cottages are intact in form and setback but many details of their external frontages have been modified in the last several decades judging by visual inspection.

The ten cottages on the subject site a fair example of small Edwardian cottages. There are many cottages like these in the Waverley area, which does not have larger houses of this period, so they can be said to be both typical and of a house that is typical of the area. There are many of them in the surrounding streets, which are recognised and protected as two Heritage Conservation Areas called Queens Park and Botany Street.

Small Edwardian semis and cottages are prolific in Sydney suburb developed at that time in working class and meet lower middle areas such as Glebe, Marrickville, Lewisham, Dulwich Hill, Mosman, Neutral Bay, St Leonards, Manly, and Drummoyne

The cottages have an historical association with the Vickery family, members of which were the developers of the land after it was separated from the main estate. In the view of the authors this is a fairly loose association which does not meet the criteria for local listing.

Heritage Significance

Statements for the War Memorial Hospital and adjacent Heritage Conservation Areas and are set out below

War Memorial Hospital

Donated to the Methodists by the Vickery family as a memorial to Ebenezer Vickery Jr, the place is an outstanding representative example of private philanthropy and the 20th century conversion of Victorian estates to institutional uses.

The War Memorial Hospital, established in 1922 by the Methodist Church as a memorial to the First World War, occupies the buildings and grounds of the former Edina estate, which is aesthetically and historically significant as a suburban Victorian estate that retains its spatial order, scale and planning, as well as four very good Victorian houses, three of which form a significant streetscape along a rare private streetscape. The Victorian landscape planning is overlaid by a 1920s landscape of significance in its own right, as are the 1930s hospital chapel and main wing.

The site's mansion tower and Norfolk Island pines have landscape urban significance as landmarks within the broader surrounding area. (CMP 2017 Hector Abrahams Architects)

Queens Park Urban Conservation Area (C14)

The Queens Park Urban Conservation Area incorporates land grants of the 1840's retaining remnant-built forms of early settlement, rural and extractive industry in Waverley, combined with sequential layers of residential subdivision associated with improved transport during the later 19th and early 20 Centuries. The resultant streetscapes have evolved in response to the natural topography forming the upper catchment of the Lachlan/ Botany aquifer and illustrate the influence of the Garden City/Garden Suburb movement upon suburban Estates in Sydney of the period 1880- 1945. The layered fabric includes notable 19th and 20th century buildings together with sites of archaeological potential related to the early European occupation and industry of Waverley. Areas within the Conservation Area retain key aspects of residences and streetscapes of the 1850's; the boom years of 1875-1890 and the Federation Era of 189-1915. The south and western extent portrays the pattern and standard of subdivisions associated with the early 1900's sale of lands about Centennial and Queens Parks as a means of subsidising development of the parks and provision of associated built surrounds of a notable and sympathetic standard of design. (State Heritage Inventory)

Botany Street Conservation Area (C3)

The urban form of the Botany Street Heritage Conservation Area is result of late 19th and early 20th Century subdivision of remaining open lands to the eastern periphery of Bondi Junction. The building streetscape is diverse and although buildings are not consistent to adjoining developments, they form a cohesive streetscape combining a variety of styles, materials and distribution of buildings along the street. The range and compatible residential types from 1890's to 1940's records the consolidation of open lands about Bondi Junction following the establishment of regular tram services. The conservation area includes representative examples of varied styles from Victorian filigree through the Inter War Art Deco. The area retains notable streetscapes, characterised by the width of road easements and the quality of residential groupings. The Conservation Area includes

notable listed buildings, including the Porter Terraces, the Congregational Church (1-3 Botany Street) and the Italianate Community Health Centre in 26 Llandaff Street. (State Heritage Inventory) (This is the description from the inventory, which has references to significance, but there is no Statement of Significance)

Blenheim Street Conservation Area (C1)

The statement of significance for this conservation area is as follows:

Blenheim Street Urban Conservation Area comprises of some of the oldest residential cottages within the Waverley Local Government Area and many early to mid-20th Century buildings. It has a high degree of integrity and great diversity of building types (cottages, bungalows and villas) and character. Many of the workers cottages still have original detailing and building form with significant archaeological potential. The area is also significant for the long and narrow block of lands and of local, historic and aesthetic significance.

It is not expected that the proposal will impact on the values of the Blenheim Street conservation area.

Blenheim Street/Bronte Road Landscape Conservation Area (C24)

The values of this area are not identified and so it is difficult to determine what impact, if any, would occur from the proposal. It is not likely that there would be a notable detrimental impact. Possible impacts on the surrounding landscape and the steps taken to ameliorate these are discussed below.

Proposals and discussion of impact on Heritage Significance

The built form envelope and landscape of the planning proposal has been understood from the following documents:

Architectus, *Uniting Waverley Master Plan Report*, February 2021

Use

Site as a whole

- The proposal is to retain dominant health use to the site, supplemented by subsidiary residential and residential aged care. This is appropriate for the site in heritage terms.

Buildings

- Build new buildings for independent living around the perimeter of the site
- Retain hospital use to the 1935 Memorial Hospital Block
- Place Residential Aged Care building at the heart of the site
- Introduce other health uses and supporting commercial uses to new buildings
- Use nos. 2-8 Church Street as ancillary childcare facilities.
- Retain existing commercial and potentially introduce community services uses and leases to Banksia, Wych Hazel and Ellerslie, subject to future study
- Uses of Vickery (originally Edina) remain undefined, with a commitment to explore options

Entrances to the site

- Retain vehicle and pedestrian historic entrances to Birrell, Carrington and Church Streets
- Return pedestrian use to original entrance on corner of Birrell Street and Bronte Road
- Introduce new entrance to Bronte Road
- Introduce two new vehicle entrances to Church Street, one for site access and one for carpark and service access.
- Introduce new vehicle entrance to Birrell Street

Fabric

Buildings (understood from 6.3.4 Built Form)

- Retain Vickery, Banksia and Wych Hazel, Ellerslie, 1935 Memorial Hospital Block and Operating theatre addition, Chapel, original Stables, and Summer house
- Retain semi-detached cottages 2&4, 6 & 8 Church Street, but remove rear wings
- Remove Elizabeth Hunter Nurses Home, Inpatient and Hydrotherapy buildings to the south (rear) of the War Memorial Hospital Building, Conrad Beard Court, Day Centre south of Ellerslie, Edina Residential Aged Care, Bushell and Johnson Apartments
- New buildings, for which envelopes only are proposed, to south of War Memorial Hospital, to west and south of Ellerslie, the RAC to the west of and on axis with Vickery, and on the western half of the estate along the perimeters with Bronte Road and Birrell Street.

Landscape Features

- Retain internal drive from Birrell Street to Vickery and War Memorial Hospital
- Construction of a lower garden in the west and conservation of the upper garden in the eastern part of the site to interpret the Victorian garden character of the estate.

- Construction of a new system of paths interpreting original drive, and around the lower garden space.
- Remove on grade car parking from the centre and western side of the site, improving the landscape of the estate as a whole.
- Impact on trees is discussed separately below.

Demolition of houses on Birrell Street

The current master plan is based on the acquisition of all required Birrell Street lots. The houses on Birrell Street have not ever been considered of sufficient significance to warrant protection. None the less, as discussed above they form the setting for other items and have a loose associative link to the Vickery history. So, the demolition of the houses brings about a small amount of heritage impact.

Since the houses do provide a sympathetic setting to the conservation areas adjacent to it, and have historical association with the War Memorial site, it is appropriate that the built form and detailing of the buildings which replace them should provide a similarly sympathetic setting. This is entirely achievable within the current planning proposal, though will of course depend to some extent on final designs.

Impact on surrounds

Although not formally recognised, Birrell Street has importance for its strong Boulevard character that makes it distinctive in Waverley.

The form of the proposed envelope for building on Birrell Street will step down parallel with the natural slope of the land. This is of positive impact as it follows how the rest of the buildings in the street relate to the land. In so doing it contributes positively to the setting of the Conservation Areas. Buildings of 5 and 6 storeys, the latter with appropriate set backs or stepped down to 4 storeys at the street level, are proposed for Birrell Street. This is an appropriate height and new buildings are all set back 4 metres, further than the historic Ellerslie. These buildings are in three groups, with D and E forming one, F and G another and H, behind Ellerslie, a third. The distance of 12m between each group is appropriate, allowing permeability and an appreciation of the site's landscaped character.

Along Bronte Road, 7 storey buildings which step down to 4 storeys at the street frontage are proposed. These appropriately scaled forms have a harmonious relationship with the street.

The changes represent an increase in scale and massing from the existing streetscape. The proposed envelopes, spaces between these envelopes, set-back from the street and stepped form all ameliorate any potential impact considerably. The proposed envelopes are not so tall or massive as to dwarf the heritage properties on Birrell Street and in the surrounding area. Mid-rise developments can and do blend well with low-rise heritage streetscapes, their success often depending on the details of the design.

Impact on aspects of the War Memorial Hospital estate

Banksia and Ellerslie

Part of the prominence of the two Vickery family houses is how close they are set to Birrell Street. The proposed setback for the envelope on the subject site is further back from these houses thus preserving a good amount of visual access presentation of the houses to the street.

Careful design will be required to ensure that building H does not overshadow or diminish Ellerslie. Whilst there is a major uplift in scale along Birrell Street, is unlikely to render a crowded effect because of the 12m gap between the nearest of these buildings and Ellerslie. Again, care must be taken with respect to not diminishing Ellerslie.

Formal entrance on corner of Birrell Street and Bronte Road

The partly intact but currently redundant formal entrance to the estate is a key space of heritage value, representing an original entrance to the Vickery estate. It is likely that future development here will present a side and front elevation at this end, evoking the former gatehouse in this location. The proposal includes the restoration of this gate to pedestrian use.

Trees on War Memorial Estate

A large number of smaller trees, mostly concentrated in the western part of the site but also along the southern part of the Carrington Road boundary and in the north east, including some identified as being of exceptional significance, are to be removed as part of this proposal. This loss will have a negative impact, but is acceptable in heritage terms because the proposal includes the revitalisation of the landscape character of the whole estate. Two particularly large trees, identified as 46 and 57 in the arborist's report, are to be replaced with trees of a similar mature transplantable size. The replacement of trees and new landscaping also supports a habitat corridor for wildlife. Care must be taken to ensure that trees except those identified are lost in the course of design and construction. If any further trees are lost, they should be replaced with trees of a similar size.

War Memorial Hospital estate functions

The subject site will be functionally related to the War Memorial Hospital, and there may be substantial positive impacts on the estate as a result of this planning proposal. By placing the burden of building to the part of the former Vickery owned land which the family sold off, it allows more open space in the middle of the estate, where gardens and visual curtilages are very important. Although this consideration cannot be part of the assessment of this planning proposal, as it is a separate proposal, it is a major consideration that could be addressed in more detail in the assessment process.

Proposed Masterplan strategy	Relevant policy of the CMP (in <i>precis</i>)	Assessment of impact
Use		
Retain dominant health use to the site	<p>Policy 4: The existing institutional governance and hospital use is a historic use that should be continued.</p> <p>Policy 5: The historic use should be broadly defined to include uses related to health, aged care and training.</p>	The future uses proposed in total comply with the policy to preserve this historic use, established by the gift of the Vickery family in 1919.
1. Retain and expand Independent Living Units (ILUs)		Retaining and extending ILU complies as a continuation of the historic hospital use
2. Retain hospital use to the 1935 Memorial Hospital Block		The proposed use of the 1935 Memorial Hospital Block complies with the policies to preserve this historic use.
3. Retain and expand Residential Aged Care to new buildings		The new proposed RAC complies as a continuation of the historic hospital use.
4. Introduce other health uses and supporting commercial uses to new buildings		Introducing new health uses and supporting commercial uses complies as a continuation of historic hospital use
5. Remove private domestic use and introduce ancillary childcare uses to the two cottages at nos. 2-8 Church Street	The cottages are not covered by the CMP.	The loss of the original domestic use of the cottages will have some moderate impact on their significance.
6. Retain vehicle and pedestrian historic entrances to Birrell, Carrington and Church Streets	<p>Policy 6: The following historic spatial uses relating to the Victorian period should continue or be re-instated:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> •early entrances and driveway; •upper garden areas as garden / passive recreation. 	The retention of the use of these entrances complies
7. Return pedestrian use to original entrance on		The proposed re-instatement complies with the policy

corner of Birrell Street and Bronte Road		
8. Introduce new entrance to Bronte Road	Policy 12: the character of new buildings and new landscape features should appear to be a development of the estate as a whole, in a similar way that the 1935 War Memorial Hospital appears in relation to Edina.	This entry adds a major new point of address to the estate. Since the original public entrance at the corner of Birrell and Bronte is never likely to have substantial use again, it is a positive expression of the estate to have this new entrance, with a considered entry sequence to the Vickery building as the main focus of the estate.
9. Introduce new vehicle entrance to Church Street		The impression of a large scale to the service entrance should be minimised, and the operation of it not disturb the domestic character of this end of Church Street. New openings must be detailed to be a well-made penetration in a boundary wall, with gates and piers appropriate to the character of the wall in this street. Entrances should be set back from the street and where possible perpendicular to the street.
10. Return pedestrian use to original back entrance in Birrell Street by way of a through-site link.		Although not required by the CMP, this proposal reinstates the use of a historical pedestrian path, and is of positive impact
11. Introduce new carpark and service vehicle access to Birrell Street		The scale of this entry should be minimised. Entrances should be set back from the street and where possible perpendicular to the street.
Fabric		
12. Retain Vickery, Banksia and Wych Hazel, Ellerslie, 1935 Memorial Hospital	Policy 3: The fabric, views and spatial relationships ranked Exceptional and High should	The masterplan retains the buildings ranked Exceptional and High in accordance with this policy.

<p>Block and Operating theatre addition, Chapel, original Stables, and Summer house</p>	<p>be conserved. They are...Victorian buildingsWar Memorial Hospital buildings of aesthetic importance: main building, chapel</p>	
<p>13. Retain semi-detached cottages 2&4, 6 & 8 Church Street, but remove rear wings</p>	<p>As Items of Environmental Heritage, consent for the cottages is subject to the Waverley DCP for Heritage. The relevant part is Section 8.2 Character, which requires (a) Development should identify and respect the contributory features and characteristics of the item or the conservation area and incorporate these features into the design.</p>	<p>The rear wings which are to demolished are small and not visible from the street. As the wings are not among the stylistic attributes that are cited in the listing, their proposed demolition has no impact on the significance of the item.</p>
<p>14. Remove Elizabeth Hunter Nurses Home, Inpatient and Hydrotherapy buildings to the south (rear) of the 1935 Memorial Hospital Block Conrad Beard Court, Day Centre south of Ellerslie, Bushell and Johnson Apartments, all of 99-121 Birrell Street.</p>	<p>Policy 3: The fabric, views and spatial relationships ranked Exceptional and High should be conserved.</p>	<p>As these buildings are not ranked of exceptional or high significance in the CMP, their removal does not contravene the policy to conserve significant fabric</p>
<p>15. New buildings, for which envelopes only are proposed, to south of War Memorial Hospital, to west and south of Ellerslie, the RAC to the west of and on axis with Vickery, and on the western half of the estate along the perimeter with Bronte Road and Birrell Street.</p>	<p>Policy 10: The siting of new buildings must respect the integrity of estate, its orthogonal and picturesque layouts, and the historic sequence of spaces. New buildings may be placed in the historic lower garden and service court spaces provided those spaces remain discernible. They may replace buildings assessed as being of moderate or low significance. New buildings should not be</p>	<p>Siting The proposal follows places most buildings in the lower garden, with the exception of one new building to the south of Ellerslie, and a new building south of the hospital, which will each replace an existing building. Additionally, the decision to site buildings around the perimeter conserves the lower garden as a space. The proposal therefore complies in terms of siting.</p>

	<p>placed in the upper garden space.</p> <p>Policy 11: the scale of new buildings should be of a scale consistent with the estate. This allows for large buildings; however, new buildings should not challenge the landmark qualities of the Edina tower or the Norfolk Island pines.</p> <p>Policy 12: the character of new buildings and new landscape features should appear to be a development of the estate as a whole, in a similar way that the 1935 War Memorial Hospital appears in relation to Edina.</p>	<p>Scale The 4, 5, and 6 storey forms along Birrell Street are in keeping with the scale of the estate. They will not overwhelm the estate. Some care must be taken with those buildings near Ellerslie that they do not overshadow or compete with it. The 4 and 7 storey forms along Bronte Rd are also in keeping with the scale of the estate. There is little risk of them competing with heritage buildings of the pines.</p> <p>Character The most positive aspect of the proposal is the reunification of the whole estate. With the new buildings sited around the perimeter and in the centre, with a new entrance on Bronte Road, this unified whole will be clearly discernible. The design and materiality of buildings should reflect this unified estate.</p>
<p>16. Removing some trees in the centre and at the perimeter of the site, while retaining most significant trees in the eastern part of the site.</p>	<p>Policy 3: The fabric, views and spatial relationships ranked Exceptional and High should be conserved. They are...1920s landscape items: palm trees, cast iron bollards, reconfigured gates to Birrell Street / Bronte Road and new gates to Carrington Road;</p>	<p>The masterplan retains the trees specifically mentioned in this policy, including the palm trees. Some significant trees will be lost as part of the proposal, having a moderate impact on the heritage. This impact is offset by the unification of the estate and restoration of its landscape character, which is of great benefit to the appreciation of its significance.</p>
<p>17. Retain internal drive from Birrell Street to Vickery and War Memorial Hospital</p>		<p>The retention of this part of the original landscape concept complies with the policy</p>

<p>18. Construct new landscape from new entrance in Bronte Road, to proposed RAC building</p>	<p>Policy 8: Creatively interpreting aspects of the history of the place should be considered as opportunities arise, including</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop the site with an appreciation of its identity as a single planned estate; • Develop the site with an appreciation of the spatial order of the estate, which is contiguous over all of its history to date. 	<p>Arriving at these gates, the visitor would have progressed through the gates, past the gatehouse, through a sequence of landscape spaces, around the pond and finally at a set of stairs leading to the upper garden space.</p> <p>The new landscape interprets this spatial order. By necessity the RAC will terminate the path somewhat early, but it retains an axial relationship with Vickery.</p> <p>Vickery will remain accessible without going through the RAC via a path to the north.</p>
<p>19. Construct new system of paths in line of original drive, and around main garden space</p>		<p>The new network of paths reintroduces a complete network over the entire estate, allowing the estate to be traversed and appreciated as a whole. This is of positive significance.</p>
<p>20. Remove on grade car parking from the centre of the site</p>	<p>Policy 6: The following historic spatial uses relating to the Victorian period should continue or be re-instated:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • early entrances and driveway; • upper garden areas as garden / passive recreation <p>Policy 9: The following reconstructions, removals and plantings should be considered:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Replacement of concrete driveways with more sympathetic material; 	<p>This proposal complies with the policy and is of positive impact.</p> <p>The removal of this carparking facilitates the restoration of the lower garden.</p>
<p>21. Allow for future replacement planting of significant trees</p>	<p>Policy 3: The fabric, views and spatial relationships ranked Exceptional and High should be conserved.</p>	<p>The replacement of trees 46 and 57 is to be a condition of the site-specific DCP. The planting of further trees would</p>

	Under the definition of Conserve, significant landscape plantings that become senescent should be replanted.	have a positive impact on the site.
22. Introduce new car parking facilities	Policy 3: The fabric, views and spatial relationships ranked Exceptional and High should be conserved. They are: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Victorian buildings and estate planning: topography, plantings, fences, statuary and spatial order (including the private street, original drive and distinction of service areas (stables and kitchen) from formal areas; 	Since the proposed car parking is located underneath the new buildings there is no impact on the significant Victorian spatial order. This is a positive heritage impact as it facilitates the removal of on-grade carparking.
Interpretation		
Construct new garden drive (pedestrian only) as an interpretation of the original driveway	Policy 9: The following reconstructions, removals and plantings should be considered: <ul style="list-style-type: none">Recreation of the original driveway path, in a manner similar to the original path (this would require the removal of buildings); ...Construction of some built or garden form on site of original gatehouse (to mark entrance). 	The proposal to interpret the entry sequence from the original driveway gates to Vickery by means of new landscaping and pathways complies with the policy.

Conclusions

This high-level heritage assessment of a masterplan finds that, assessed against the policies of a current CMP, the proposal has important positive impacts on the significance of this site.

1. It is a vision to renew the historic health use on a community concept.

It is central to the history and significance of this site that the nineteenth century Vickery Estate was gifted to the Methodist Church for a hospital, and the Vickery family remained active in the hospital. When measured against the historic use and intentions for the site, the vision of the masterplan to create “a broader restorative place”, is found to be highly consistent with the cultural significance of the site. The compatibility is in terms of use and retention of the buildings and estate which were gifted to the church.

2. It seeks to interpret the whole of a historic estate which was given to this use by the Vickery family in 1919.

This assessment finds the proposed arrangement of space on the site displays a good understanding and makes a strong interpretation of the estate as a whole. This is of very positive heritage impact. Whilst it is common for heritage to be sidelined in sites of historic estates, in this case the historic spatial order of the estate has been recovered more fully and new spaces and buildings arranged in response to it. In particular, the primacy of the Vickery and Hospital buildings amid their large trees is preserved by the locating of new taller buildings well in the western part of the site.

3. There is no major loss of heritage significance as a result of this proposal.

This assessment finds that there is a significant impact from the loss of a number of trees on the site. This loss is ameliorated by the replacement of two of the largest trees, and the landscaping of the estate as a whole which restores the unification of the estate. Whilst the loss of these trees is not unimportant, in our view the recovery of a comprehensive landscape of the estate is of greater importance.

The high-level master plan prepared for the proposal and the DCP agreed between the proponent and Council are suitable for the conservation and sensitive renewal of the site. Therefore, in consideration of the above, the planning proposal is acceptable in heritage terms and should be approved by the authority.